

# **CASE REPORT**



# COVID-19 exposes weaknesses in public health in the Peruvian Amazon and highlights opportunities for a One Health approach

Verónica Ormea<sup>1</sup>\*<sup>0</sup>, Roberto Evaristo<sup>1</sup><sup>0</sup>, Salomon Durand<sup>2</sup><sup>0</sup>, Andrew Lover<sup>3</sup><sup>0</sup>, and Simon R. Rüegg<sup>4</sup><sup>0</sup>

# **Abstract**

The Amazon is home to important wildlife and a biodiversity hotspot of global importance. The ancestral knowledge kept by Indigenous communities about its fauna and flora contributes further to its irreplaceable value. The Peruvian Amazon was heavily struck by the COVID-19 epidemic with a cumulative incidence of 725, a mortality rate of 34 per 100,000 inhabitants, and a case fatality rate of 4.6% by the end of July 2020. In this work, we review scientific literature and media to trace the events that happened at the beginning of the COVID-19 epidemic in the Peruvian Amazon. Results are synthesized in three observations: (1) the evolution of the COVID-19 epidemic within the Peruvian Amazon and the response of the Peruvian health care system, (2) Confusing information about Ivermectin use for COVID-19 treatment and prevalent self-medication (3) The response of the traditional Indigenous health care system to the COVID-19 epidemic. These three observations are interdependent. There is an unexploited potential for integrative approaches linking traditional medical practices (TMP) and biomedical approaches and they may benefit from the interactions that occur between them. Synergies can also be explored between the human and animal health care sector, especially in terms of the use and stewardship of medicines. We conclude that there is a benefit of the One Health approach in the region, which can go through the common ambition to improve the integrated health of people, animals and ecosystems, facilitate the enhancement of equity and inclusion while improving access to health services and conserving biodiversity.

# One Health impact statement

The Amazon region is home to wildlife flora and fauna and indigenous Amazon communities. The case presented in this work shows that an existing grassroots initiative has been reducing case fatality rates tenfold during the COVID-19 epidemic, while acting in respect towards nature and the environment, and using its resources. This is in stark contrast to the uncontrolled, ineffective self-medication with ivermectin in that same period, which may endanger the biodiversity hotspot through metabolic residues. While the current example seems to illustrate community resilience due to government negligence, it also shows the vastly unexplored potential of integrating biomedical and traditional indigenous knowledge in a solidaric and co-creative framework such as One Health.

Keywords: Peruvian Amazon, ivermectin, traditional medical practices (TMP), One Health, COVID-19, biodiversity

# Introduction

The Amazon region is a biodiversity hotspot of global importance (IUCN, 2021). It is distributed among the Pan-Amazonian region which encompasses the countries of Brazil, Peru, Bolivia, Colombia, Venezuela, Guyana, Suriname, French Guiana and Ecuador, covering a total area of 6 million km² and it is home to Indigenous

Amazon people (Sousa *et al.*, 2022). The Peruvian Amazon is one of the three natural regions of Peru and it is located in northeast of the country, characterized by its richness in vegetation, rivers, rainfall and low population density (Hernández-Vásquez *et al.*, 2022). A Census in 2017 detailed that 212,823 Peruvians self-identified as Amazonian Indigenous of which 156,486 (73.5%) lived

Affiliations: <sup>1</sup>Health Sciences Faculty, Universidad Peruana de Ciencias Aplicadas, Lima, Peru; <sup>2</sup>Equipo COVID-19 DGIESP, Ministerio de Salud del Peru (MINSA), Iquitos, Peru; <sup>3</sup>School of Public Health and Health Sciences, University of Massachusetts-Amherst, Amherst, MA, USA; <sup>4</sup>Section of Epidemiology, Vetsuisse Faculty, University of Zürich, Switzerland

\*Corresponding author: Verónica Ormea. Email: veronica.ormea@upc.edu.pe

Received: 19 September 2022. Accepted: 21 February 2023. Published: 05 April 2023

© The Authors 2023. Open Access. This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/. The Creative Commons Public Domain Dedication waiver (http://creativecommons.org/publicdomain/zero/1.0/) applies to the data made available in this article, unless otherwise stated in a credit line to the data.

in rural and 56,337 (26.5%) in urban areas. Only 77,510 (36.4%) learned Spanish in their childhood – the national language of Peru (Instituto Nacional de Estadística e Informática (INEI), 2017). Access to healthcare services for the Amazonian Indigenous communities living in rural areas is obstructed by geographical dispersion, poor communication roads (Soto-Cabezas et al., 2022), low availability and high cost of transportation and socio-cultural inequities (Hernández-Vásquez et al., 2022). Consequently, most communities are only accessible by boat such as canoes and traditional boats (Instituto Nacional de Estadística e Informática (INEI), 2017) and transportation of patients is prohibitively expensive (Hernández-Vásquez et al., 2022).

Rural Amazon communities' concept and practices of health focus on the well-being of their communities and rely on traditional medicine, including the use of medicinal plants, special food preparations and diet restrictions and rituals with the participation of close family members and spiritual healers (Carrillo *et al.*, 2022). The people of the Amazon region have a history of being marginalized, especially in regard to access to primary health care (Gianella *et al.*, 2019; Ramírez *et al.*, 2020; Vázquez-Rowe and Gandolfi, 2020; Sousa *et al.*, 2022). Socio-cultural barriers are related to the lack of inclusion of their cultural beliefs and traditional medicine as these practices are not integrated into the Peruvian health system (Brierley *et al.*, 2014).

By July 31, 2020, the Peruvian Amazon region presented a cumulative COVID-19 incidence of 725 (110,068/15,192,638), a mortality rate of 34 per 100,000 inhabitants (5102/15,192,638), and a case fatality rate of 4.6% (19,217/414,735) (Instituto Nacional de Estadística e Informática (INEI), 2009; Ministerio de Salud-DGE, 2022). Peru was among the six countries most impacted by COVID-19 worldwide (World Health Organization, 2022) with 655 deaths per 100,000 inhabitants and a 5.2% case-fatality rate as of September 18, 2022 (Johns Hopkins Coronavirus Resource Center, 2022).

During the COVID-19 pandemic, Ivermectin was recommended without scientific evidence (Lescano and Pinto, 2020) using media like YouTube channels, TV interviews (Molento, 2020) and newspapers (Alvarez-Risco et al., 2020) which led people to easily opt to self-medicate as Ivermectin was sold without prescription in some drugstores and black markets (Mega, 2020). Ivermectin is a broad-spectrum antiparasitic used worldwide in both human and animal health. In humans, it is commonly used as a treatment for strongyloidiasis, onchocerciasis and filariasis, generally as part of mass drug administration strategies in African settings (Speare and Durrheim, 2004). In veterinary medicine, it is commonly used for the control of diverse endo- and ectoparasites in both livestock and companion animals (Crump and Ōmura, 2011). The therapeutic index of ivermectin is relatively high and consequently, only heavy overdosing causes neurological side effects in both humans (Cook, 1995) and animals (Shoop et al., 1995). However, non-target organisms such as aquatic animals, in contrast, may be very sensitive to ivermectin toxicity, and residues of the active compound itself or its metabolic derivatives can seriously harm ecological systems where overuse occurs (Wall and Strong, 1987). Ivermectin had already a good reputation for the control and treatment of parasitic infections in humans (Speare and Durrheim, 2004) and animals (Crump and Ōmura, 2011).

The present work describes the events that occurred during the first COVID-19 wave in the Peruvian Amazon and reflects on the potential of the One Health (OH) approach could bring to the region.

# Methods

We reviewed scientific literature and the press to narrate the events that happened at the beginning of the COVID-19 epidemic in the Peruvian Amazon and searched for reports and scientific publications about ivermectin off-label use. The findings were structured into distinct themes based on grounded theory, a

systematic methodology frequently used in qualitative research. In essence, the method posits that as researchers review the data, ideas or concepts become apparent to them. These ideas/concepts are said to 'emerge' from the data. In the present process, scientific and media publications were interpreted collectively by the researchers as they became available, and the emerging themes were further investigated to clarify ambiguities.

# Results

The case study is structured along three major themes of observation: (1) the evolution of the COVID-19 epidemic within the Peruvian Amazon and the response of the Peruvian health care system, (2) Confusing information about Ivermectin use for COVID-19 treatment and prevalent self-medication, and (3) the response of the traditional Indigenous health care system to the COVID-19 epidemic.

# THE EVOLUTION OF THE COVID-19 EPIDEMIC WITHIN THE PERUVIAN AMAZON AND THE RESPONSE OF THE PERUVIAN HEALTH CARE SYSTEM

A lockdown was implemented throughout Peru on March 16, 2020, ten days after the first COVID-19 case was reported (Lainez et al., 2021). Within 5 days of the first case, daily oxygen demand in hospitals exceeded supplies. Throughout the country, there was only a very limited diagnostic test capacity available, which combined with the lack of drugs (Fraser, 2020), medical oxygen (Ramírez et al., 2020) and personal protective equipment (PPE) for medical staff, made it challenging to contain the spread of the epidemic (Garcia et al., 2020).

After the publication of in vitro efficacy to inhibit SARS-Cov-2 replication in cell cultures (Caly et al., 2020), in May the Ministry of Health of Peru (MINSA) approved the use of ivermectin for the treatment of mild, moderate and severe COVID-19 cases with dosing at 1 drop (200 µg) per kilogram of body weight for two days (Ministerio de Salud del Perú, 2020). In this "Resolución Ministerial N270-2020-MINSA", ivermectin was placed on the list of strategic drugs, and its supply was ensured for the treatment of mild cases in primary health care establishments. Once ivermectin treatment was widely available, routine clinical use started rapidly and included both inpatient and outpatient treatments (Chamie-Quintero et al., 2021). The MINSA also officially supported its use for both pre- and post-exposure prophylaxis (Instituto Nacional de Salud del Peru, 2021). Nevertheless, primary health care services were not able to attend to the exponentially growing demand from people with severe clinical SARS-CoV-2 infections (Schwalb and Seas, 2021). This serious national situation was also exacerbated by the high incidence of infections among health care workers (Chafloque-Vásquez et al., 2020; Alvarez-Antonio et al., 2021).

In the Peruvian Amazon, the situation was further aggravated by limited access to health care services, largely due to logistic constraints, as all supplies must be delivered by boat or airplane (roads are often absent) and the services rely on a very small number of medical doctors and health professionals with a lack of critical supplies. The first COVID-19 case within the region was detected in Iquitos, the capital of the Loreto, and the area with the largest number of Peruvian Amazon Indigenous communities. In July 2020, a serosurvey in Iquitos found an adjusted seroprevalence of anti-SARS-CoV-2 IgG and IgM antibodies of 70% (Alvarez-Antonio et al., 2021). Loreto had one of the highest mortality rates in the country (Ramírez et al., 2020), with 50 deaths per 100,000 inhabitants (Ministerio de Salud-DGE, 2020).

# CONFUSING INFORMATION ABOUT IVERMECTIN USE FOR COVID-19 TREATMENT AND PREVALENT SELF-MEDICATION

It is challenging to distinguish "maladroit" communication from an "infodemic", which implies that some players deliberately manipulate the information to cause confusion, contradiction and segregation in society. One could argue that the lack of scientific evidence in the use of ivermectin set the scene for infodemics to later cause self-medication (Lescano and Pinto, 2020). The term "infodemic" is the combination of the words "information" and "epidemic" and refers to the excess of information which increases exponentially in a very short time, making it increasingly difficult for the public to access reliable information (García-Saisó et al., 2021). In the context of COVID-19, scientific information has been intensely manipulated or mixed with false recommendations, rumors, stigma and/or conspiracy theories, leading to a twinned viral and informational epidemic (Islam et al., 2020). The combination of rapidly increasing case numbers, an already fragile health system, and incomplete information on the effectiveness of ivermectin (when the observations of Caly et al. (2020) were not confirmed in clinical settings) in public and social media (Schwalb and Seas, 2021), encouraged self-medication and widespread use of both prescribed and non-prescribed drugs. In Peru self-medication, i.e. the practice of selecting and using medicines to treat self-recognized symptoms and health-related problems (World Health Organization, 1998), is a frequent practice associated with both demographic (social, cultural and personal norms) and health system factors (limited access to medicines and other healthcare services) (Urrunaga-Pastor et al., 2019), and often strongly encouraged by the press and media (Lainez et al., 2021). A study about the proportion of citizens unable to recognize fake news during the COVID-19 epidemic found that this proportion was largest in Peru among populations from Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia and Mexico and that Peruvians had an indiscriminatory great confidence in the content of social media news (Nieves-Cuervo et al., 2021). Another study observed that a better education level was associated with having correct ideas about COVID-19 and that the scarce information given by Peruvian authorities about the management of COVID-19 resulted in the lowest level of knowledge about how to manage new diseases (Mejia et al., 2022). In this context, some physicians encouraged the use of drugs such as ivermectin to prevent COVID-19 cases (Maguiña-Vargas and Palacios-Celi, 2020), and some magazines even presented front-page articles praising the veterinary formulation of ivermectin as the cure for COVID-19 infections (Alvarez-Risco et al., 2020). Ivermectin was initially approved as an official COVID-19 treatment by the Ministry of Health (MINSA) on May 8, 2020, and the recommendation was withdrawn on September 7, 2020 because of the lack of evidence for its effectiveness (Quispe-Cañari et al., 2021). However, during those months, there were authorities and organizations supporting the use of ivermectin, as on May 10, 2020, the Peruvian College of Veterinary Doctors expressed its support for MINSA recommendations about the inclusion of ivermectin in the treatment of human COVID-19 cases, to later request the authorization that the veterinary formulation could be used in the treatment of those cases (Lescano and Pinto, 2020). In the same way, some academics and well-known physicians published letters about its effectiveness (Portmann-Baracco et al., 2020), and a veterinarian promoted its use, while simultaneously promoting a COVID-vaccine that his own company produces and discredited internationally recognized vaccines (Diario El Comercio, 2021). Other misinformation recommended the use of hydroxychloroquine, azithromycin (Quispe-Cañari et al., 2021) and warfarin to prevent COVID-19 (Martinez-Rivera and Taype-Rondan, 2020; Acuña-Chavez et al., 2021). Consequently, the uncertainty about effective means to mitigate the effects of COVID-19 grew in a state in which the health system had collapsed.

The demand for ivermectin rapidly increased throughout Peru. The limited availability of ivermectin preparations for human use on the market led to a dramatic increase in prices with large differences between private and public pharmacies (Tenorio-Mucha *et al.*, 2020; Schwalb and Seas, 2021). This led to many people using preparations intended for veterinary use, including parenteral formulations, as an alternative to scarce human doses. The demand for all formulations of ivermectin still increased and prices for the

drug were extremely high, leading to the emergence of an illegal market for veterinary ivermectin (Mega, 2020). Subsequently, on May 26, 2020, the General Directorate of Medicines, Supplies and Drugs (DIGEMID) issued a statement that specifically addressed the rising concern about the use of veterinary ivermectin formulations for COVID-19 treatment in humans (Ministerio de Salud-DIGEMID, 2020). This alert explicitly stated that ivermectin can only be prescribed by authorized medical personnel under supervision and monitoring for any adverse drug reactions.

There are no official reports of the total quantity of ivermectin imported or delivered (or which product(s) were delivered), nor any estimates on the number of people who self-medicated with veterinary ivermectin formulation during this period – which we will further define as "off- label use". To estimate the extent of this "off-label" use, we compared the quantities of ivermectin imported into Peru for animal health purposes from 2019 to 2021 (Veritrade, 2022): in 2019—903 kg; in 2020—3738 kg; and in 2021—1096 kg. We infer that in 2020, an excess of approximately 2,800 kg of veterinary ivermectin was imported, and likely offered off-label to people. With an estimated 14mg per treatment (for 70kg body weight), this would correspond to approximately 200 million treatments within a population of 32 million. Chamie-Quintero et al. (2021) describe some cases of routine clinical use of ivermectin based on the written press (Table 1).

We also examined a peer-reviewed case report on the *subcutaneous* application of veterinary ivermectin as COVID-19 treatment: in June 2020 in Iquitos, Loreto, Peruvian Amazon, two persons presented with necrotic skin ulcers after having suffered from moderate symptoms of a SARS-CoV-2 infection. It was determined that these ulcers occurred 5–8 days after subcutaneous injection of veterinary ivermectin as treatment (Ramal-Asayag *et al.*, 2020); the report did not specify the cause of the ulcerations.

# THE RESPONSE OF THE TRADITIONAL INDIGENOUS HEALTH CARE SYSTEM TO THE COVID-19 EPIDEMIC

Due to the large excess mortality rates in the Peruvian Amazon, a grassroots initiative called "Comando Matico" emerged. This initiative was formed by volunteers who revived traditional knowledge and practices by using medicinal plants and therapies (conventional and traditional medicine) which were used by ancestral female healers to care for patients who were unable to access health services in remote communities (Delgado and Herrera, 2021; Montag et al., 2021). They also interacted with medical doctors to adapt their treatments to the needs of Indigenous communities (Balvín Bellido, 2021; Montag et al., 2021). Despite these important efforts to contain the pandemic and maintain traditional knowledge, some leading traditional healers died from COVID-19 infections. Moreover, Indigenous populations lost their trust in the modern health care system and were increasingly reluctant to visit hospitals (Delgado and Herrera, 2021).

# **Discussion**

These three observations are interdependent. They illustrate that the fragility of the health care system may lead to people seeking their own path to health, at the risk of being misled at various crossroads. The present work highlights the importance of scientific grounding when evaluating drugs for public recommendations as pointed by Lescano and Pinto (2020). Furthermore, the WHO has published principles for effective communication as a tool to respond to worldwide infodemics (World Health Organization, 2023). Interestingly, a number of principles were violated during the COVID-19 pandemic in Peru: (I) Accessible communication: vulnerable populations like Indigenous, rural and village people have poor access to digital information channels and press and were therefore not reached by the MINSA statements. (II) Actionable, (IV) relevant and (VI) understandable recommendations: recommendations were addressed to medically trained experts and did not consider the state of knowledge and scope of action

**Table 1.** An overview of newspapers describing the veterinary ivermectin off-label use in the Peruvian Amazon.

		Stakeholder involved			Sources	
	Year 2020	donation	reception	Amount donated	(PRESS)	Cited by
Loreto	May-11	veterinarian	local medical college	6000 doses in 2 weeks	Panamericana televisión (2020)	(Chamie- Quintero <i>et al.</i> , 2021)
	June 18	medical doctor	General public	15,000 doses	Diario Ahora (2020)	
Ucayali	April	Political parties, government authorities	local authorities and health centers	Using radio stations promoted the application of veterinary ivermectin to 5000 people aprox.	El Pais (2020)	(Chamie- Quintero <i>et al.</i> , 2021)
Nauta, Loreto region	June 19	A mayor, evangelical group	General public	Delivering 500 doses plus a donation of 1000 additional supplies	El Comercio, 2020	(Fowks, 2020)

of ordinary citizens and people with specific risks; (III) Credibility: The information could have been more elaborated in addressing errors and acknowledging uncertainty, and there was a lack of coordination with the other partners in the health care system.

Our example also illustrates that there is an unexploited potential for integrative approaches linking Indigenous medical practices and the biomedical approach to form a more resilient health care system. Traditional medical practices (TMP) rely on locally available resources, and have the potential to absorb much of the acute needs for health care (Pesantes and Camila, 2020). While reports on the efficiency and effectiveness of traditional medicine are limited, Caretas (2020) and the Centro Amazónico de Antropología y Aplicación Práctica (CAAAP) (2020) reported that the grassroots initiative "Comando Matico" had treated people in Amazon communities during the first wave of COVID-19 resulting in a roughly tenfold lower case fatality rate (0.37% = 2 deaths in 538 treated people) compared to 4.6% at national level (Ministerio de Salud-DGE, 2020). In contrast, this initiative may not be able to deal with the more severe conditions as were seen in moderate and severe COVID-19 cases. By shifting the first response to TMP, and focusing biomedical health care on those severe cases. where TMP may reach its limits, valuable resources can be liberated for the more resource-intensive biomedical health care. Both, traditional and modern medical practices may benefit from their interaction in the learning process of sharing and receiving knowledge and adequate this knowledge to their medical practices and to the need of the respective communities they are treating. At the same time, Indigenous health practitioners may benefit from these interactions, e.g. through advice about the use of PPE and safer biosecurity practices. However, to transit patients seamlessly from one caretaker to the next, they must be linked in an integrated framework. For this integration it is critical that all actors value each other's worldview, skills, practices and impact (Hitziger et al., 2017; Riley et al., 2021; Berger-Gonzalez et al., 2022).

Secondly, synergies could be generated between the human and the animal health care sector. As the off-label use of ivermectin against COVID-19 demonstrates dramatically, a shortage of supply in one sector may be filled, deliberately or not, by the other. As an example, this has been effectively implemented for the cross-domain treatment of *Strongyloides stercoralis* (Barrett *et al.*, 2016; Zeitler *et al.*, 2018). However, if such synergy is not foreseen in drug regulations, this practice may be pushed to "grey markets" – such as the off-label self-medication with ivermectin – and thus not benefit from professional guidance. There is a toxicity risk with every patient that uses ivermectin without medical advice (in oral and parenteral treatment). As a consequence, the 2.8 tons of ivermectin (and its metabolites) presumably administered during the COVID-19 epidemic across Peru may well have detrimental

effects on aquatic ecosystems and soil fauna in a global biodiversity hotspot like Amazonia. Indeed, the concentration of metabolites of many drugs in water and soil has risen during the pandemic (Morales-Paredes *et al.*, 2022). This is known to impact the life cycles of invertebrate fauna like dung beetles, earthworms, springtails and enchytraeids, and affect vertebrates that are susceptible to ivermectin like turtles (Teare and Bush, 1983; Mesa *et al.*, 2020; de Souza and Guimarães, 2022). These organisms fulfill key roles in food webs, and thus the second-round effects of drugs constitute a serious risk to the health and well-being of humans, animals and ecosystems.

Interestingly, we did not find published data or case reports regarding the off-label use of corticosteroids (largely dexamethasone), which were recommended by the WHO against severe symptoms of SARS-CoV-2 infections (World Health Organization, 2020) in the Peruvian context. The Peruvian government recommended the use of steroids to alleviate COVID-19 symptoms but simultaneously pointed out the risks of self-medication (Ministerio de Salud del Perú, 2021).

Independently of the pandemic, the promotion of self-medication with potent drugs is problematic and there is a need for awareness and sensitization on the consequences that self-medication brings (Quispe-Cañari et al., 2021). The same applies to medication without medical guidance in animal health. Golovliov et al. (2021) found that 35% (142/408) of clients of veterinary services in Lima (Peru's capital), gave medicines to their companion animals without first visiting a veterinary clinic. The most frequent drugs that owners gave to their pets were analgesics/anti-inflammatories (46/142), followed by antiparasitic drugs (33/142). These drugs do not require a veterinary prescription as they can be bought in pet shops, but the same risks result from self-medication as owners may not have adequate knowledge for disease diagnosis and treatment. The study also found that 63% (255/408) of the respondents did not know or hear about "antimicrobial resistance" (AMR) (Golovliov et al., 2021). This result is alarming in the context of the observed frequency of self-medication with potent drugs in humans and animals. It emphasizes the importance of sensitization and awareness campaigns provided by the government and academic institutions and organizations about the risks of medication without medical guidance, antimicrobial resistance and environmental toxicity.

The integration of TMP, the human and animal health sectors, and environmental sustainability programs, requires an integrated approach like One Health (OH). The approach has been described as building on systems thinking, intersectoral planning, transdisciplinarity and infrastructure to facilitate sharing, learning and decentralized, adaptive governance (Rüegg et al., 2017).

Systems thinking and transdisciplinarity allow the combination of knowledge with different epistemic paradigms from TMP, biomedicine and life science. Transdisciplinarity also facilitates the mobilization of tacit knowledge specific to the remote sites at which the Indigenous Amazonian communities live, to identify the practical and relevant synergies in health service provision. These are clearly distinct from those in urban settings and include difficulties in disseminating relevant information appropriately (Soto-Cabezas et al., 2022). The participation of citizens in decisions fosters inclusion, stewardship and helps to reduce the structural discrimination of Indigenous Peoples that has been highlighted by the COVID-19 pandemic (Mallard et al., 2021; Montag et al., 2021; Solis and Nunn, 2021). Indigenous Amazonian communities are well organized, have a sense of community as a family, respect their elderly and live their tradition based on the respect of biodiversity and the environment. The valuation of TMP and its integration into health policies would thus directly contribute to the ambitions of the One Health High-Level Expert Panel and the Convention on Biological Diversity to simultaneously improve the health of people, animals and ecosystems (Convention on Biological Biodiversity, 2017; Adisasmito et al., 2022). Building legislation that foresees sharing of resources and information across the sectors and allowing for decentralized adaptive governance which is informed by feedback from the changing environment, would allow exploiting the synergies between the human and animal health sector mentioned above. It would be embedded in the local socio-ecological system, facilitate rapid, targeted deployment of the scarce resources available under difficult logistic conditions and contribute to resilience in situations of crisis. Essentially, an OH approach to emerging health threats could encode solidarity and cultural humility in a legal framework that would set the scene for better health for more living beings in the future.

From a central government perspective, an OH approach presents new opportunities and challenges. As it implies an explicit delegation of control to peripheral governance structures, it bears the promise of being more inclusive with the challenge of creating accountability. The need to evaluate and demonstrate the relevance of local and national efforts to promote OH is thus central and must include aspects of equity, efficiency and improved health outcomes in people, animals and ecosystems as well as the processes of knowledge integration (Rüegg et al., 2018). The decentralized governance also attributes new roles to the actors in the health system. As explored by Hitziger et al. (2018) the potential synergies generated by OH approaches are often hampered by limitations in both health governance structures and policy implementation. In an OH approach, central governments would have more responsibility in identifying, endorsing and valuing emerging local initiatives like the "Comando Matico". These must be complemented and integrated with basic services like primary health care, and for informed decision making the local governance structures should be supplied with data correcting for the currently under investigated populations (Mallard et al., 2021; Solis and Nunn, 2021). In return, cross-sectoral planning across different scales from local to national governance would prevent emerging. self-organizing initiatives such as the "Comando Matico" are used to justify the neglected or slow response of state institutions and the government (Delgado and Herrera, 2021).

Finally, because Indigenous Amazonian communities live in nine countries of the Amazon under similar socio-economic conditions, the COVID-19 pandemic, AMR and other emerging health threats can be viewed as transboundary problems for which national and local policies can be coordinated across borders and governance levels.

# **CONFLICT OF INTEREST**

The authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

# **ETHICS STATEMENT**

All relevant guidelines were followed.

# **DISCLAIMER**

The views expressed in this article reflect the result of research conducted by the author and do not necessarily reflect the position of any department or institution nor the Peruvian Government.

### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

We acknowledge the feedback and contribution of Dr. Carola J. Salas and the anonymous reviewers to improve this manuscript.

# **AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS STATEMENT**

All authors approved the submitted version. VO and SR designed the original manuscript. Tables were designed by VO. RE, SD, AL and SR finalized the review.

# **FUNDING STATEMENT**

The authors received no specific funding for this work.

# References

Acuña-Chavez, L., Farfán-Castillo, A., Martin-Castro, A. and Fasanando-Vela, R. (2021) Ivermectina y Warfarina: Un Potencial Peligro para la Salud Pública Peruana. *Revista Del Cuerpo Médico Hospital Nacional Almanzor Aguinaga Asenjo* 14(1), 90–91. DOI: 10.35434/rcmhnaaa.2021.14S up1.1185.

Adisasmito, W.B., Almuhairi, S., Behravesh, C.B., Bilivogui, P., Bukachi, S.A. *et al.* (2022) One Health: A new definition for a sustainable and healthy future. *PLOS Pathogens* 18(6), e1010537. DOI: 10.1371/journal. ppat.1010537

Alvarez-Antonio, C., Meza-Sanchez, G., Calampa, C., Casanova, W., Carey, C. *et al.* (2021) Seroprevalence of anti-SARS-CoV-2 antibodies in Iquitos, Peru in July and August, 2020: A population-based study. *Lancet Global Health* 9(7), E925–E931. DOI: 10.1016/S2214-109X(21)00173-X.

Alvarez-Risco, A., Mejia, C.R., Delgado-Zegarra, J., Del-Aguila-Arcentales, S., Arce-Esquivel, A.A. *et al.* (2020) The Peru Approach against the COVID-19 Infodemic: Insights and Strategies. *The American Journal of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene* 103(2), 583–586. DOI: 10.4269/ajtmh.20-0536.

Balvín Bellido, S. (2021) Elementos identitarios indígenas desde la autogestión comunitaria en tiempos de la pandemia de COVID-19: los jóvenes shipibos voluntarios del Comando Matico. *Anthropía* 18, 85–107. DOI: 10.18800/anthropia.2021.004.

Barrett, J., Broderick, C., Soulsby, H., Wade, P. and Newsholme, W. (2016) Subcutaneous ivermectin use in the treatment of severe Strongyloides stercoralis infection: Two case reports and a discussion of the literature. *Journal of Antimicrobial Chemotherapy* 71(1), 220–225. DOI: 10.1093/jac/dkv315.

Berger-Gonzalez, M., Scotti, F., Garcia, A.I., Hesketh, A., Hitziger, M. *et al.* (2022) Green Health in Guatemala: How can we build mutual trust and partnerships to develop an evidence-base for local medicines and realize their potential. *Botany* 100(2), 109–126. DOI: 10.1139/cjb-2021-0070.

Brierley, C., Suarez, N., Arora, G. and Graham, D. (2014) Healthcare access and health beliefs of the indigenous peoples in remote Amazonian Peru. *American Journal of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene* 90(1), 180–183. DOI: 10.4269/ajtmh.13-0547.

Caly, L., Druce, J.D., Catton, M.G., Jans, D.A. and Wagstaff, K.M. (2020) The FDA-approved drug ivermectin inhibits the replication of SARS-CoV-2 in vitro. *Antiviral Research* 178, 104787. DOI: 10.1016/j. antiviral.2020.104787.

Caretas (2020) Comando Matico: la medicina tradicional shipiba que salva vidas. Caretas Nacional. Available at: https://caretas.pe/nacional/comando-matico-la-medicina-tradicional-shipiba-que-salva-vidas/.

Carrillo, R., Guzman, W.C., Leon-Velarde, F., Bernabe, A., Jimenez, M.M. et al. (2022) Peru Progress in health and sciences in 200 years of independence. *The Lancet Regional Health—Americas* 7, 5. DOI: 10.1016/j.lana.2021.100148.

Centro Amazónico de Antropología y Aplicación Práctica (CAAAP) (2020) Jorge Soria (Comando Matico): "No podíamos quedarnos de brazos cruzados viendo a nuestros familiares en estado crítico." Available at: https://www.caaap.org.pe/2020/08/25/jorge-soria-comando-matico-nopodiamos-quedarnos-de-brazos-cruzados-viendo-a-nuestros-familiaresen-estado-critico/.

Chafloque-Vásquez, R., Pampa-Espinoza, L. and Celis, J. (2020) Seroprevalencia de COVID-19 en trabajadores de un hospital de la Amazonía peruana. *Acta Médica Peruana* 37(3), 390–392. DOI: 10.35663/amp.2020.373.1050.

Chamie-Quintero, J., Jennifer, H. and Scheim, D. (2021) Sharp reductions in COVID-19 case fatalities and excess deaths in Peru in close time conjunction, state-by-state, with ivermectin treatments. In: *SSRN*. Elsevier BV, Amsterdam, Netherlands. DOI: 10.2139/ssrn.3765018.

Convention on Biological Biodiversity (2017) *Guidance on Integrating Biodiversity Considerations into One Health Approaches*. UNEP, Montreal, QC, Canada, p. 17.

Cook, G.C. (1995) Adverse effects of chemotherapeutic agents used in tropical medicine. *Drug-Safety* 13, 31–45. DOI: 10.2165/00002018-199513010-00005.

Crump, A. and Ōmura, S. (2011) Ivermectin, 'Wonder drug' from Japan: the human use perspective. *Proceedings of the Japan Academy. Series B, Physical and Biological Sciences* 87(2), 13–28. DOI: 10.2183/pjab.87.13.

de Souza, R. and Guimarães, J. (2022) Effects of Avermectins on the Environment Based on Its Toxicity to Plants and Soil Invertebrates—A review. *Water Air Soil Pollution* 233, 259. DOI: 10.1007/s11270-022-05744-0.

Delgado, D. and Herrera, D. (2021) Were Indigenous Peoples' Vulnerable or Resilient? Strategies to Cope with Covid-19 in the Peruvian Amazon Basin. Social Science Research Council. Available at: https://items.ssrc.org/covid-19-and-the-social-sciences/covid-19-fieldnotes/were-indigenous-peoples-vulnerable-or-resilient-strategies-to-cope-with-covid-19-in-the-peruvian-amazon-basin/.

Diario El Comercio (2021) Manolo Fernández: algunas frases controversiales de quien buscan integrar a comisión de caso 'Vacunagate.' Available at: https://elcomercio.pe/lima/sucesos/ivermectinavacunas-y-covid-19-un-factcheking-a-las-frases-del-medico-veterinario-manolo-fernandez-farvet-vacuna-peruana-noticia/?ref=ecr.

Fowks, J. (2020) Un grupo evangélico peruano inyecta un medicamento veterinario a miles de personas para la covid-19. *El Pais* 395, 1684.

Fraser, B. (2020) COVID-19 strains remote regions of Peru. *The Lancet*. DOI: 10.1016/S0140-6736(20)31236-8.

Garcia, P.J., Alarcón, A., Bayer, A., Buss, P., Guerra, G. et al. (2020) COVID-19 Response in Latin America. *The American Journal of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene* 103(5), 1765–1772. DOI: 10.4269/ajtmh.20-0765.

García-Saisó, S., Marti, M., Brooks, I., Curioso, W., González, D. et al. (2021) The COVID-19 infodemic. *Rev Panam Salud Publica* 45, e56. DOI: 10.26633/RPSP.2021.56

Gianella, C., Pesante, M.A., Ugarte-Gil, C., Moore, D.A.J. and Lema, C. (2019) Vulnerable populations and the right to health: lessons from the Peruvian Amazon around tuberculosis control. *International Journal for Equity in Health* 18, 28. DOI: 10.1186/s12939-019-0928-z.

Golovliov, K., León, D., Silva, P. and Falcón, N. (2021) Medicación sin prescripción veterinaria en animales de compañía en Lima, Perú (2020). *Revista de Investigaciones Veterinarias Del Perú* 32, 5. DOI: 10.15381/rivep.v32i5.21343.

Hernández-Vásquez, A., Bendezu-Quispe, G. and Turpo Cayo, E. (2022) Indigenous communities of Peru: Level of accessibility to health facilities. *Journal of Taibah University Medical Sciences* 17(5), 810–817. DOI: 10.1016/j.jtumed.2022.02.006.

Hitziger, M, Berger Gonzalez, M., Gharzouzi, E., Ochaíta Santizo, D., Solis Miranda, R. *et al.* (2017) Patient-centered boundary mechanisms to foster intercultural partnerships in health care: A case study in Guatemala. *Journal of Ethnobiology and Ethnomedicine* 13, 44. DOI: 10.1186/s13002-017-0170-y.

Hitziger, M., Esposito, R., Canali, M., Aragrande, M., Häsler, B. *et al.* (2018) Knowledge integration in One Health policy formulation, implementation and evaluation. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization* 96(3), 211–218. DOI: 10.2471/BLT.17.202705.

Instituto Nacional de Estadistica e informatica (INEI) (2009) *PERÚ: Estimaciones y Proyecciones de Población por Departamento, Sexo y Grupos Quinquenales de Edad 1995-2025. Boletín de Análisis* 

 $Demográfico\ N^{\circ}\ 37$ . Available at: http://proyectos.inei.gob.pe/web/biblioineipub/bancopub/est/lib0846/libro.pdf.

Instituto Nacional de Estadística e Informática (INEI) (2017) La autoidentificación étnica: Población indigena y afroperuana. Censos Nacionales 2017. Available at: https://www.inei.gob.pe/media/MenuRecursivo/publicaciones\_digitales/Est/Lib1642/.

Instituto Nacional de Salud del Peru (2021) Eficacia y Seguridad de Ivermectina para la prevención de la infección por SARS-CoV-2 (Actualización al 01 de febrero del 2021) (p. 28). UNIDAD DE ANÁLISIS Y GENERACIÓN DE EVIDENCIAS EN SALUD PÚBLICA. SERIE REVISIONES RÁPIDAS N° 01-2021. Available at: https://docs.bvsalud.org/biblioref/2022/01/1354236/rr\_01\_ivermectina\_act\_feb21.pdf.

Islam, M., Sarkar, T., Khan, S., Mostofa Kamal, A., Hasan, S. et al. (2020) COVID-19-Related Infodemic and Its Impact on Public Health: A Global Social Media Analysis. *American Journal of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene* 103(4), 1621–1629. DOI: 10.4269/ajtmh.20-0812.

IUCN (2021) Peru. Available at: https://iucngreenlist.org/country/peru/.

Johns Hopkins Coronavirus Resource Center (2022) *Mortality Analyses*. Available at: https://coronavirus.jhu.edu/data/mortality.

Lainez, R.H., Salcedo, R.M. and Madariaga, M.G. (2021) COVID-19 infection in the developing world: The Peruvian perspective. *Transactions of The Royal Society of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene* 115(9), 941–943. DOI: 10.1093/trstmh/trab074

Lescano, J. and Pinto, C. (2020) Ivermectina dentro del protocolo de tratamiento para la COVID-19 en Perú: Uso sin evidencia científica. *Salud Y Tecnología Veterinaria* 8(1), 27–34. DOI: 10.20453/stv.v8i1.3789.

Maguiña-Vargas, C. and Palacios-Celi, M. (2020) El manejo del COVID-19: un dilema entre la ciencia y el arte terapéutico. *Acta Médica Peruana* 37(2), 228–230. DOI: 10.35663/amp.2020.372.1028.

Mallard, A., Pesantes, M.A., Zavaleta-Cortijo, C. and Ward, J. (2021) An urgent call to collect data related to COVID-19 and Indigenous populations globally. *BMJ Global Health* 6(3), e004655. DOI: 10.1136/bmjgh-2020-004655.

Martinez-Rivera, R. and Taype-Rondan, A. (2020) Overmedication in COVID-19 Context: A Report From Peru. *Journal of Clinical Pharmacology* 60(9), 1155–1156. DOI: 10.1002/jcph.1704.

Mega, E.R. (2020) Latin America's embrace of an unproven COVID treatment is hindering drug trials. *Nature* 586(7830), 481–482. DOI: 10.1038/d41586-020-02958-2.

Mejia, C., Aveiro-Robalo, T., Garlisi Torales, L., Fernández, M., Bonilla-Rodríguez, F.E. *et al.* (2022) Basic COVID-19 knowledge according to education level and country of residence: Analysis of twelve countries in Latin America. *Frontiers in Medicine* 9, 978795. DOI: 10.3389/fmed.2022.978795.

Mesa, L., Gutierrez, M.F., Montalto, L., Perez, V. and Lifschitz, A. (2020) Concentration and environmental fate of ivermectin in floodplain wetlands: An ecosystem approach. *Science of the Total Environment* 706(1), 135692. DOI: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.135692.

Ministerio de Salud-DGE (2020) *Situacion Actual "COVID-19" Perú—2020(31 de julio)*. Available at: https://www.dge.gob.pe/portal/docs/tools/coronavirus/coronavirus310720.pdf.

Ministerio de Salud-DGE (2022) Salas situacionales COVID-19. Available at: https://www.dge.gob.pe/portalnuevo/covid-19/situacion-del-covid-19-en-el-peru/.

Ministerio de Salud-DIGEMID (2020) Alerta Digemid nº 15—2020. Uso Indebido De Ivermectina Para Animales En El Tratamiento De Covid-19 En Humanos. Dirección General de Medicamentos, Insumos y Drogas. Available at: https://www.digemid.minsa.gob.pe/UpLoad/UpLoaded/PDF/Alertas/2020/ALERTA\_15-20.pdf.

Ministerio de Salud del Perú (2020) Documento Prevención, Diagnóstico y Tratamiento de personas afectadas por COVID-19—Resolucion Ministerial No 270-2020-MINSA, p. 4. Available at: https://cdn.www.gob.pe/uploads/document/file/694719/RM\_270-2020-MINSA.PDF.

Ministerio de Salud del Perú (2021) *Minsa: Uso de corticoides en etapas tempranas de COVID-19 aumenta riesgo de mortalidad.* Available at: https://www.gob.pe/institucion/minsa/noticias/396550-minsa-uso-de-corticoides-en-etapas-tempranas-de-covid-19-aumenta-riesgo-de-mortalidad/.

Molento, M.B. (2020) COVID-19 and the rush for self-medication and self-dosing with ivermectin: A word of caution. *One Health* 10, 100148. DOI: 10.1016/j.onehlt.2020.100148

Montag, D., Barboza, M., Cauper, L., Brehaut, I., Alva, I. et al. (2021) Healthcare of Indigenous Amazonian Peoples in response to COVID-19: marginality, discrimination and revaluation of ancestral knowledge in Ucayali, Peru. *BMJ Global Health* 6(1), e004479. DOI: 10.1136/bmjgh-2020-004479.

Morales-Paredes, C., Rodríguez-Díaz, J. and Boluda-Botella, N. (2022) Pharmaceutical compounds used in the COVID-19 pandemic: A review of their presence in water and treatment techniques for their elimination. *Science of the Total Environment* 814, 152691. DOI: 10.1016/j. scitotenv.2021.152691.

Nieves-Cuervo, G., Manrique-Hernández, E., Robledo-Colonia, A. and Grillo, A. (2021) [Infodemic: fake news and COVID-19 mortality trends in six Latin American countriesInfodemia: notícias falsas e tendências na mortalidade por COVID-19 em seis países da América Latina]. *Rev Panam Salud Publica* 45, 4. DOI: 10.26633/RPSP.2021.44

Pesantes, M.A. and Camila, G. (2020) ¿Y la salud intercultural?: Lecciones desde la pandemia que no debemos olvidar. *Mundo Amazónico* 11(2), 93–110. DOI: 10.15446/ma.v11n2.88659.

Portmann-Baracco, A., Bryce-Alberti, M. and Accinelli, R. (2020) Antiviral and Anti Inflammatory Properties of Ivermectin and Its Potential Use in COVID-19. *Archivos de Bronconeumologia* 56(12), 831. DOI: 10.1016/j. arbres.2020.06.01.

Quispe-Cañari, J.F., Fidel-Rosales, E., Manrique, D., Mascaró-Zan, J., Huamán-Castillón, K.M. *et al.* (2021) Self-medication practices during the COVID-19 pandemic among the adult population in Peru: A cross-sectional survey. *Saudi Pharmaceutical Journal* 29(1), 1–11. DOI: 10.1016/j. jsps.2020.12.001.

Ramal-Asayag, C., Espinoza-Venegas, L.A., Celis-Salinas, J.C. and Maguiña-Vargas, C. (2020) Úlcera dérmica por ivermectina subcutánea en el tratamiento de COVID-19. *Revista de La Sociedad Peruana de Medicina Interna* 33(2), 88. DOI: 10.36393/spmi.v33i2.526.

Ramírez, J.D., Sordillo, E.M., Gotuzzo, E., Zavaleta, C., Caplivski, D. et al. (2020) SARS-CoV-2 in the Amazon region: A harbinger of doom for Amerindians. *PLOS Neglected Tropical Diseases* 14(10), e0008686. DOI: 10.1371/journal.pntd.0008686.

Riley, T., Anderson, N.E., Lovett, R., Meredith, A., Cumming, B. *et al.* (2021) One health in indigenous communities: A critical review of the evidence. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 18, 11303. DOI: 10.3390/ijerph18211130.

Rüegg, S.R., McMahon, B.J., Häsler, B., Esposito, R., Nielsen, L.R. *et al.* (2017) A blueprint to evaluate One Health. *Frontiers in Public Health* 5, 1–5. DOI: 10.3389/fpubh.2017.00020.

Rüegg, S.R., Häsler, B. and Zinsstag, J. (eds) (2018) *Integrated Approaches to Health: A Handbook for the Evaluation of One Health*, 1st edn. Wageningen Academic Publishers, The Netherlands. DOI: 10.3920/978-90-8686-875-9

Schwalb, A. and Seas, C. (2021) The COVID-19 pandemic in Peru: What went wrong? *American Journal of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene* 104(4), 1176–1178. DOI: 10.4269/ajtmh.20-1323.

Shoop, W., Mrozik, H. and Fisher, M. (1995) Structure and activity of avermectins and milbemycins in animal health. *Veterinary Parasitology* 59(2), 139–156. DOI: 10.1016/0304-4017(94)00743-v.

Solis, A. and Nunn, C.L. (2021) One health disparities and COVID-19. *Evolution, Medicine, and Public Health* 9(1), 70–77. DOI: 10.1093/emph/eoab003.

Soto-Cabezas, M., Reyes, M., Soriano, A., Rodríguez, J., Ibargüen, L. *et al.* (2022) COVID-19 among Amazonian indigenous in Peru: mortality, incidence, and clinical characteristics. *Journal of Public Health (Oxf)* 44(3), e359–e365. DOI: 10.1093/pubmed/fdac058.

Sousa, A., Herkrath, F., Wallace, C., Farmer, J. and Bousquat, A. (2022) Primary health care in the Amazon and its potential impact on health inequities: a scoping review. *Rural Remote Health* 1, 6747. DOI: 10.22605/RRH6747.

Speare, R. and Durrheim, D. (2004) Mass treatment with ivermectin: an underutilized public health strategy. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization* 82(8), 562.

Teare, J. and Bush, M. (1983) Toxicity and efficacy of ivermectin in chelonians. *Journal of the American Veterinary Medical Association* 183(11), 1195–1197. https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/6689009/

Tenorio-Mucha, J., Lazo-Porras, M., Hidalgo, A.M., Málaga, G. and Cárdenas, M.K. (2020) Precios de medicamentos esenciales para el manejo y tratamiento de la COVID-19 en establecimientos farmacéuticos peruanos públicos y privados. *Acta Médica Peruana* 37(3), 267–277. DOI: 10.35663/amp.2020.373.1560.

Urrunaga-Pastor, D., Benites-Zapata, V.A. and Mezones-Holguín, E. (2019) Factors associated with self-medication in users of drugstores and pharmacies in Peru: An analysis of the National Survey on User Satisfaction of Health Services, ENSUSALUD 2015. *F1000Research* 7(8), 23. DOI: 10.12688/f1000research.17578.2.

Vázquez-Rowe, I. and Gandolfi, A. (2020) Peruvian efforts to contain COVID-19 fail to protect vulnerable population groups. *Public Health in Practice* 1, 100020. DOI: 10.1016/j.puhip.2020.100020.

Veritrade (2022) Información de comercio exterior de latinoamérica y el mundo. Available at: https://www.veritradecorp.com/.

Wall, R. and Strong, L. (1987) Environmental consequences of treating cattle with the antiparasitic drug ivermectin. *Nature* 327, 418–421. DOI: 10.1038/327418a0.

World Health Organization (1998) *The Role of the Pharmacist in Self-Care and Self-Medication: Report of the 4th WHO Consultative Group on the Role of the Pharmacist.* Available at: http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/65860/WHO\_DAP\_98.13.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y.

World Health Organization (2020) *Corticosteroids for COVID-19*. WHO/2019-NCoV/Corticosteroids/2020.1. Available at: https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/WHO-2019-nCoV-Corticosteroids-2020.1.

World Health Organization (2022) WHO Coronavirus (COVID-19) Dashboard. Available at: https://covid19.who.int/table.

World Health Organization (2023) WHO Principles for Effective Communications. Available at: https://www.who.int/about/communications/principles.

Zeitler, K., Jariwala, R., Restrepo-Jaramillo, R., Kapadia, S., Casanas, B. et al. (2018) Successful use of subcutaneous ivermectin for the treatment of Strongyloides stercoralis hyperinfection in the setting of small bowel obstruction and paralytic ileus in the immunocompromised population. BMJ Case Reports, 3. DOI: 10.1136/bcr-2017-223138.